

Buddhists under Cover

Why a Secretive Shinshū Society Remains Hidden Today

Clark CHILSON

What has been set down in this letter is the right meaning of faith, taught by Master Shinran of our tradition. Those who thoroughly understand these points must never discuss anything to do with this faith.... (Rennyō, *Ofumi* II-2)¹

THROUGHOUT JAPAN today there are numerous secretive Buddhist societies that preach what they claim is the true Shinshū not readily available to the public. They hold undisclosed religious services, as they have for hundreds of years, based on a secret text that only they possess. Although their existence is not completely unknown, their religion is invisible to virtually all nonmembers: where they meet, what they teach, and what they do are guarded secrets. Over the past hundred years only a fortunate few have been able to peek in on them to do research; it is only by chance that I came to know some of them.

There are two distinct types of secretive Shinshū societies: those in Kyushu that were formed in the early Edo period (1600–1868) when their religion was outlawed; and those between Hiroshima and Aomori Prefecture, which trace their lineages of “secret teachings” back to the late thirteenth century. Among scholars, secretive Shinshū societies in Kyushu are called *kakure nenbutsu* かくれ念仏, in reference to the fact that members were forced into hiding to avoid persecution by local authorities. Those in central and northern Japan are known as *kakushi nenbutsu* かくし念仏, since they have always advocated keeping their teachings concealed. Characterizing the two types as reactive hiding (*kakure*) and active hiding (*kakushi*) is not completely accurate, since to some extent both groups have passively and actively hidden their religion at different times. Still, the terms are helpful for highlighting different historical roots as well as the greater stress on secrecy among the groups in central and northern Japan.

¹ The translation of this text was taken from Minor and Ann Rogers, *Rennyō: The Second Founder of Shin Buddhism* (Berkeley: Asian Humanities Press, 1991), 174.

I was able to do research on a *kakushi nenbutsu* group as the result of a fortuitous encounter in November of 1998. When I was first invited to their temple, I was completely unaware that they were a secretive Shinshū society. In fact, I did not even know that such societies existed in the area. It was only after discussing my visit with my colleague and former mentor Peter Knecht that I suspected they might in fact be a secretive society. Subsequent visits to their temple and a review of studies by Kadoya and Kikuchi² on secretive Shinshū societies where similar activities and teachings are explained, confirmed the fact that the group I had encountered was indeed one of many semiautonomous *kakushi nenbutsu* societies.

Members of the societies refer to their religion as *Ura* (undercover) Shinshū to distinguish it from institutional Shinshū or what they call *Omote* (open) Shinshū. They refer to themselves as *zaike* 在家, but to distinguish them from other Shinshū followers who call themselves *zaike*, I will use the term *Ura-zaike* in what follows.

The *Ura-zaike* who invited me to their temple knew of my research interests from the very beginning. I was able to participate in some of the activities at the temple and ask questions. Within six weeks of my first visit, however, I was encouraged to undergo their secret initiation to receive the “faith” (信心 *shinjin*) and become a member of the society. When I made it clear that I was only interested in observing the ritual as a scholar, I was denied the opportunity. Nonetheless, they did allow me to continue to visit them on certain days. This essay is, therefore, based only on such information as they chose to make available to me.

The literature on secretive Shinshū societies is quite limited. To the best of my knowledge, nothing has been published on the *kakushi nenbutsu* today in English. Even in Japanese the sources are scant, and there seems to be no publication that presents an overview of an *Ura-zaike* society in the Chūbu region. The situation is not likely to change soon. The *Ura-zaike* themselves do not produce any written material, since, as I was told, they “do not engage in PR” and in general are skeptical of scholars.

This is especially true in Miyagi Prefecture, where Takahashi Bonsen 高橋梵仙, a former instructor at Taishō University and the author of the most important work on *kakushi nenbutsu*,³ became head of a group in the late 1940s after persuading the widow of an *Ura-zaike* temple to entrust the lineage of the society to him.⁴ He later enraged the *Ura-zaike* when he sued the widow and a well-known

² 門屋光昭 Kadoya Mitsuaki, 『民俗宗教シリーズ: 隠し念仏』 [Folk religion: The hidden *nenbutsu*] (Tokyo: Tōkyōdō Shuppan, 1989). 菊地 武 Kikuchi Takeshi, 「東海地方における秘事法門について」 [Secret believers in the Tōkai region], インド学仏教研究 21 (1973): 190–1. Also see Kikuchi's 「かくし念仏と法会: 秘事法門」, 戸川安章 Togawa Anshō, ed., 『仏教民俗学大系 7: 寺と地域社会』 [Studies in Buddhist ethnology 7: Temples and local society] (Tokyo: Meicho Shuppan, 1992).

³ 『念仏考』 [Thoughts on the *nenbutsu*] (Tokyo: Nihon Gakujutsu Shinkōkai, 1956).

⁴ For an overview of this incident see Kadoya, 3–9.

kakushi nenbutsu leader named Satō Kanzō 佐藤勘藏 for libel after they criticized him in a magazine. When the court ruled in Takahashi's favor, the Ura-zaike apparently became so embittered that today they will not even talk with Ura-zaike from other areas.⁵

While the fact that the sources on secretive Shinshū societies are limited comes as no surprise, it is unfortunate that more research has not been done, since they raise a number of questions that can contribute to our understanding of lay Buddhist groups in Japan. How and why do people become involved with a secretive Buddhist society? How do they reinterpret religious texts and canonize new ones? How do they relate to and confront institutional Buddhism? Perhaps the most important question that needs to be addressed first, however, is why they keep their activities and teachings secret, even though they are not illicit and have the constitutional right to hold their beliefs.

My aim in this essay is to offer an answer to this question through a brief analysis of the history, practices, teachings, and initiation rites of one secretive Shinshū society in the Chūbu region. I will argue that, unlike the *kakure nenbutsu* and the *kakure Kirishitan* in Kyushu, who seem to remain in hiding primarily because hiding has become part of their identity over the centuries,⁶ the Ura-zaike whom I observed are hiding not only out of historical inertia, but also because they have a clear rationale that they must hide to protect the teachings, and because secrecy enhances the value of the religion and the Ura-zaike's control over it.

A Brief Oral Account of the History

The Ura-zaike trace their teachings back to Shinran and see themselves as preserving the ultimate meaning (極意 *gokui*) of his *Kyōgyōshinshō* 教行信証.⁷ To protect these difficult and easily misunderstood teachings, Shinran communicated them to only a few select disciples rather than write them down for everyone. During his own lifetime, however, Shinran's son Zenran, who had been given the true teachings, distorted them to his own advantage while teaching in the Kantō region.

⁵ When the leader of the group I interviewed went there, the Ura-zaike in the area refused to talk with him despite their similar beliefs.

⁶ For more on secretive Shinshū societies see 米村龍治 Yonemura Ryūji, 『殉教と民衆』 [Martyrdom and populace] (Kyoto: Dōhōsha, 1987) and 小栗純子 Oguri Junko, 『妙好人とかくれ念仏』 [The *myōkō* and hidden *nenbutsu*] (Tokyo: Kōdansha Gendai Shinsho, 1975). For more on why the *kakure Kirishitan* remain in hiding today see Crystal Whelan, "Religion concealed: The *kakure Kirishitan* on Narushima" *Monumenta Nipponica* 47 (1992): 369–87, and Ann Harrington's "The *kakure Kirishitan* and their place in Japan's religious tradition." *Japanese Journal of Religious Studies* 7 (1980): 318–36. For book-length overviews on the *kakure Kirishitan* see Ann Huntington, *Japan's Hidden Christians* (Chicago: Loyola University Press, 1993) and Stephan Turnbull, *The Kakure Kirishitan of Japan* (Surrey: Curzon Press, 1998).

⁷ This history was related to me by an Ura-zaike leader on 17 November 1998.

Zenran's corrupted teaching infuriated the "24 disciples" (二十四輩 *nijū shihai*),⁸ and Shinran was forced to disown his son to protect the true Shinshū.

The true teachings were preserved by Nyoshin, Shinran's grandson and Zenran's son, who founded Hongan-ji.⁹ For eight generations up to the time of Rennyo, the true teachings were transmitted orally among the clergy (口訣相伝 *kuketsu sōden*). Rennyo, as the restorer of Shinshū, spread Shinshū teachings throughout the country through his letters (御文 *ofumi*). After becoming chief abbot of Hongan-ji and receiving the true teachings, he decided that instead of passing the teachings on to a member of the Shinshū clergy before he died, he would break with tradition and give the true teachings to the laity. Rennyo felt, the Ura-zaike claim, that the Hongan-ji priests were too corrupt to be trusted any longer with the teachings, which they were using to enrich themselves. Rennyo therefore gave the true teaching to Yoshimasu Hanshō, a doctor and Shinshū layman. These true teaching of Shinran, which at some point were written down in a text called the *Gosho* 御書, have been passed down for fourteen generations right up to the present day among lay Shinshū members who have served as the leaders of Ura-zaike.

An Overview of a Secretive Society Today

Many Ura-zaike meet in the homes of the society's leaders, but the Ura-zaike whom I observed meet in their own temple, which is about the size of a large Japanese two-storey house. Unlike most other groups, they were able to fund the building of their own facilities due to a donation from a wealthy member in the early years of the century of a tract of land, which they were able to sell to the town in the 1980s for building a road. With this money the Ura-zaike constructed a temple consisting of several small rooms, a large kitchen, and a large tatami-mat room that seats about forty people comfortably. This room, where all religious services are held, resembles the main sanctuary (本堂 *hondō*) of a Shinshū temple. There are gold-colored shrines (厨子 *zushi*) that house icons of Amida and Shinran; in front of the icons, flowers are placed and candles and incense are burned; there is a worship platform (礼盤 *raiban*) upon which the head teacher sits to recite the *Amida-kyō* 阿彌陀經; and next to the *raiban* there is a bell (*daikin*) used to announce the beginning and end of services.

Most of the members who frequent the temple are from the local area. A few of them live within walking distance, but some need to travel as much as thirty min-

⁸ The proper pronunciation for this term referring to the 24 disciples, according to the 『真宗新辞典』 [Shinshu dictionary] (Kyoto: Hōzōkan 1983), is *nijūyohai*.

⁹ Nyoshin founded Hongan-ji with Shinran's daughter, Kakushinni.

utes. The number of members is probably around 80, of which about 30 regularly attend services.¹⁰ The vast majority of the members who attend services regularly are over 60 years of age, and women significantly outnumber the men. All those who come to the temple have been introduced either by an Ura-zaike friend or by a relative.

Motivations for attending services vary, but the most common reason seems to be companionship with others of a similar stage in life who are also interested in religion and who find the intimate atmosphere of the society appealing. Several of the newer members I talked with expressed an interest in religion before they knew of the Ura-zaike. One man said he traveled to religious centers all over the country before being brought to the temple. Another man, whose wife was also a member, told me that until he got married his household was affiliated with Sōtō Zen, but when he took over his wife's household he became a *danka* 檀家 of their Shinshū temple. He was completely ignorant of Shinshū and wanted to learn more when he was brought to the temple.

After joining the society, Ura-zaike are not required, or even expected, to break their association with other temples or religious groups. Most Ura-zaike are *danka* of other temples that are not necessarily Shinshū, and when they die the priests from these temples perform the funeral and memorial rites. Participating in other religious activities is not a problem, since the Ura-zaike already have the "faith" (*shinjin*). One woman told me that in addition to the Ura-zaike temple she also went to a Nichiren temple and to another temple associated with Kōbō Daishi to pray for her ancestors and for her husband who had died ten years previously.

Ura-zaike Leaders

The main teacher and leader of the religious services and initiation rites is called the Zenchishiki 善知識 (literally, one of virtue and knowledge).¹¹ He serves as chief interpreter and guardian of the teachings, and is the only one allowed to have a copy of the *Gosho* that contains the secret teachings. Tradition mandates that before he dies he must pass the *Gosho* on to no more than three worthy disciples. If he does not find anyone worthy of the text, he must burn it before he dies so that it does not slip into the hands of someone who might distort the teachings and use them to make money. The Zenchishiki with whom I spoke is perhaps in his late 60s and was the Zenchishiki of at least one other group that met in his home. He had

¹⁰ I base this estimate on the number of different people who have shown up for festivals and services since I began my fieldwork.

¹¹ Skt. Kalyāṇamitra—an accomplished Buddhist teacher who helps others on the Buddhist path. The term in Omote Shinshū is used to refer to the chief abbot of the sect.

been a member of another secretive Shinshū society since he was a child, but when the previous Zenchishiki for the temple died in 1997, he was asked by his teacher to take over the society that I was allowed to visit. He is not an especially charismatic personality, but he is a good speaker and well-versed in Shinshū doctrine.

In addition to the Zenchishiki, there are seven elderly men who lead services and preach. They, like the Zenchishiki, all wear black vestments similar to Shinshū priests, even though they claim that they are laymen and not priests. It is a source of pride to them that they perform religious services without pay. Unlike Omote Shinshū priests, who, as the sons of priests, generally feel an obligation to succeed their fathers as priests, all the leaders of the Ura-zaike felt it an honor to become a leader and to be allowed to preach. Most of the leaders were born into an Ura-zaike family, although in most cases their fathers had not been leaders. Although uncommon, it is possible for those who join the society quite late to become leaders, as is evidenced by a leader in his mid-eighties who only became a member after he had turned sixty. Several of the current leaders were asked to become leaders when they were in their thirties, but said they needed to make a living first, and so were only able to lead services after they retired and had more time.

To become a Zenchishiki and to receive the *Gosho* one has to go through a rigorous process of training, the details of which were not disclosed to me. For the other leaders, however, there is little formal training. They are given an Amida name (阿号 *agō*), but there is nothing resembling an ordination ceremony. Before they become active leaders, they are simply instructed for a day on what it means to be a leader of the Ura-zaike, on the importance of transmitting the teachings faithfully, and on the need to avoid selfishness.

Activities

Three to four times a month religious services known as *sozoku* are held. These may be attended by those who have been brought to the temple but have not started the initiation process. As a noninitiate, these were the only religious services, besides festivals, that I was permitted to observe.

The schedule for a typical *sozoku* is as follows:

10:00 A.M.	Recitation of the <i>Amida-kyō</i> and hymns (和贊 <i>wasan</i>)
10:30 A.M.	Sermon by one of the leaders
12:00 P.M.	Free lunch in the kitchen
1:00 P.M.	Sermon by the Zenchishiki
2:00 P.M.	Break
2:15 P.M.	Sermon by one of the leaders
3:00 P.M.	Service ends

Each sermon begins and ends with the ringing of a bell and several recitations of the *nenbutsu*. Sermons, which are given by the leaders, usually consist of a reading of Rennyō's *ofumi* or a *wasan* intermixed with commentary based on narratives that have been handed down "over many generations." The Zenchishiki usually talks about a Shinshū doctrine and often gives examples of how it applies to the personal lives of Ura-zaike or how it relates to current events. The Zenchishiki's sermons I attended were rich in metaphors and humor, which made them a joy to listen to. In terms of content, they were generally focused on the way that human beings are burdened by desires and illusions (煩惱 *bonnō*), and yet are all equally capable of being saved by Amida.

Besides the *sozoku*, noninitiates can also attend the Hōonkō and the Eitaikyō festivals. The Hōonkō is held on the seventh of January, and, as with the Hōonkō at Omote Shinshū temples, the *Shōshinge* 正信偈 (Hymn of true *shinjin* and *nenbutsu*) is recited and stories are told of events in Shinran's life using illustrated scrolls. Eitaikyō are held twice a year at the time of the equinoxes to show gratitude to members' ancestors for giving birth to them as humans and to form a relationship with the Buddha (仏さんと縁を結ぶ). On this day the *Higan-e ofumi* 彼岸會御文¹² is read, the *Amida-kyō* is recited, and the *odori nenbutsu* 踊り念仏 is performed for the repose of the souls of the deceased.

Teachings on Shinjin

The purpose of all human beings, according to the Ura-zaike, is to become buddhas. This is what the Zenchishiki said separates us from animals that only "eat and defecate." To become a buddha like Amida, one must receive the *shinjin* from Amida. In Omote Shinshū theology, *shinjin* is a much discussed term that is usually translated as "faith." In *The Collected Works of Shinran*, published by one of the premier Omote denominations, Honganji-ha, the term is defined as "One's entrusting to Amida's Primal Vow, which is at the same time the negating of one's calculative thinking, brought about by Amida's working."¹³ The Ura-zaike do not conceive of *shinjin* in such abstract terms, preferring to speak of it almost as if it were a concrete object.

Asking to receive the *shinjin* represents, for the Ura-zaike, a means for guaranteeing salvation. The term they use for asking is *tanomu*, another important term in Shinshū theology that the Ura-zaike believe the Omote priests do not com-

¹² The *Higan-e ofumi*, I strongly suspect, is an apocryphal text unique to the Ura-zaike. It does not appear in standard Shinshū dictionaries nor in the 『仏書解説辞典』 [Explanatory Buddhist dictionary]. One of the few places where this text can be bought is Yoshizaki, where the secret teachings flourished in medieval times.

¹³ *The Collected Works of Shinran* (Kyoto: Jōdo Shinshū Hongwanji-ha, 1997), vol. 2, 206.

pletely understand. The Zenchishiki recounted a television interview he saw with a top-ranking priest from Nishi Hongan-ji in which the interviewer asked the priest what the term *tanomu* means in Shinshū. The priest replied that *tanomu* refers to our reliance on Amida and our need to rely on Amida. The Zenchishiki argued that this was wrong, that *tanomu* in Shinshū does not mean to rely on, it means to ask; we must ask (*tanomu*) Amida for *shinjin*, not just rely on Amida.

The benefits of receiving *shinjin* are experienced not just after one dies but in this life as well. Upon receiving the *shinjin*, a person is said to experience great happiness. Salvation, as it is was often stressed in sermons, is not something for after you die, but is to be achieved in the here and now. Amida is a deity who wants people to be happy now. He bestows numerous worldly benefits (現世利益 *genze riyaku*) that outsiders may find hard to believe. This is why the blessings that Amida gives to those with *shinjin* (信心決定者 *shinjin ketsujō sha*) are not to be talked about. The Zenchishiki preaches that, unlike some new religions that promise worldly benefits to lure people into their religions, true Shinshū must hide the worldly benefits that Amida grants because in Shinshū “everything is this-worldly benefits.”

The Initiation Process

The initiation rites of the society are not to be observed by outsiders, lest they cause misunderstandings. Only those who are being initiated or who have received *shinjin* are allowed to participate in the initiation process. As mentioned earlier, this was why I was refused permission to attend the initiation rites. I was, however, given a basic overview of what an initiation entails.¹⁴ The process involves about twelve sessions that can be divided into four stages: an introduction to the society, a rite for receiving *shinjin*, sermons in which the true teachings are taught, and rites of incorporation.

The first stage of the initiation in which potential new members are introduced to the society is called *zenben* 前弁. On the day this is held, potential initiates listen to lectures on one of Rennyo's *ofumi* and the *Gosho*. The meaning of these are illustrated with stories that emphasize that all can be saved by Amida regardless of previous deeds, education, or socioeconomic background. The initiate is also clearly told on this day that there are two types of Shinshū temples, the Omote temples such as Higashi and Nishi Hongan-ji, and Ura temples, of which they are one. The Omote temples are open to everyone and their teachings are public. Ura temples, however, cannot be visited without an introduction, and what they teach is not open to the public. It is explained that the Ura temples are for receiving *shinjin*,

¹⁴ For a description of similar rites of secretive Shinshū societies in central Japan, see Kikuchi 1973, and Kikuchi, 1992, cited in note 2 above.

and that what is taught at them is the true, unadulterated (*sono mama*) meaning of Shinshū. The temples do not use signs or advertisements because they do not openly proselytize; every interested person is led individually to the temple “by hand” (手引 *tebiki*).

After the *zenben* a person is given the opportunity to receive *shinjin* in a rite called *ichinen kimyō* 一念帰命.¹⁵ The *ichinen kimyō*, which was described to me as serving a function similar to a Christian baptism, is the most important initiation rite. It guarantees salvation and allows one to understand the true Shinshū teachings that are taught during the *oyaku* お益 (merit) sermons. There are approximately seven *oyaku* sermons held about once a month on one of the set meeting days when the initiate can attend. The last stage of the initiation process is held in May and consists of three rites.

The first is called *tenpai* 天盃, which, like a wedding, includes *sansankudo* 三三九度 (three-three-nine times) or three formal sips of sake from three different-sized cups, moving from smallest to the largest. The second is called *muneage shiki* 棟上式, a term that usually refers to a ceremony done when the framework for a house has been finished. The third and final rite is the *oreiza* お礼座, which consists of questions and answers similar to Zen *mondō* 問答. I was told that, as is the case with the Zen ordination ceremony in contemporary Japan, the answers to the questions are given in advance, though for a different reason: as Shinshū believers, they rely on Other-power (他力 *tariki*).

The entire initiation process usually takes about a year, but it can take longer depending on how often an initiate is able to come to the temple. One informant told me that it took him three years to complete the initiation process. Once the initiation is over, one is a full member of the society and is eligible to participate in all the temple’s activities and to understand the true teachings.

The Reason for Secrecy

When asked directly why the Ura-zaike hide their religion, the Zenchishiki explained to me that it was in order to keep the true teachings from being corrupted, particularly by those who would try to use the teachings for monetary gain. This idea of protecting the teachings from corruption by concealment is a fundamental part of the Ura-zaike religion reinforced by historical depictions, sermons, and initiation rites. The oral history of the secret teachings validates the practice by depicting Zenran as having twisted the teachings for his own benefit, and by honoring Rennyō for having given the teachings to a layman to keep them from being

¹⁵The term *ichinen kimyō* appears in Kakunyo’s *Ganganshō* 願々鈔, in which it refers to the first occurrence of *shinjin*.

corrupted by a clergy bent on using them for monetary gain. Since the Ura-zaike have been entrusted with true teachings that are subject to distortion, they must protect them by proselytizing among individuals they know rather than making them available for just anyone. All potential new members of the society are told explicitly during the sermons and the initiation process that the teachings are secret. This is one of the reasons for the lengthy initiation process and the slow disclosure of the true teachings over many months. In other words, one needs to be indoctrinated not only in the content of the teaching but also in the need for keeping them hidden. This also gives the Zenchishiki and other leaders a greater opportunity to assess new members and to expel those whom they do not trust before they have been told too much.

For the Ura-zaike today, secrecy is a vital part of their religion not easily dispensed with. To break the seal would mean a radical departure from their own history and from the history of their Shinshū doctrine. It would require an explanation as to why, after hundreds of years of hiding their activities and teachings, it was now no longer necessary, and why after so long the teachings are now immune from corruption. The Ura-zaike would further have to alter their perception of themselves as those who have been entrusted with the teachings, and hence would need to abandon their unique role as guardians of Shinran's ultimate teachings. They would even be forced to revise drastically their understanding of their religion as "Ura" Shinshū as opposed to open or Omote Shinshū. In short, to practice and preach openly would be to repudiate the rationale for their long tradition of secrecy.

Today, however, the Ura-zaike remain in hiding for another reason than the weight of tradition. It is part of their identity. In this sense, they are like the hidden Christians, though hardly to the same extent. For the Ura-zaike, concealment belongs to their conviction that the teachings would soon be corrupted if they were let out in the open. As is evident in their sermons and initiation rites, the Ura-zaike still feel threatened—not by persecution, but by outsiders who might use the true Shinshū teachings for their own benefits and in the process pervert them.

Besides their tradition and desire to protect the teachings, there are at least two additional benefits: secrecy enhances the significance of their religion and increases their control over it. It shrouds the "truth" in an aura of mystery, giving it a value it would not have on the open market of religious doctrine. The exclusivity associated with being an Ura-zaike allows each member to think of himself or herself as one of the fortunate few who are privy to the truth. Secrecy facilitates control by limiting the numbers of the faithful. By keeping a firm grip on who becomes a member and who does not, the Zenchishiki and leaders are able to safeguard themselves against challenges from outsiders, particularly from Shinshū priests who regard them as heretics.

Concluding Remarks

The frequent religious services, the continued proselytizing, and the numerous initiation rites of the Ura-zaike at a private temple in central Japan testify to the fact that, although secretive Shinshū societies remain largely invisible to us, they continue to thrive today and are not mere vestiges of a bygone era. Their tradition, their rationale for hiding, and the benefits they derive from secrecy will no doubt for some time into the future continue to motivate them to remain secret. Their rationale, in particular that as a group of lay men and women they must protect the true Shinshū teaching from being corrupted by those who might use it for financial gain, will continue to be persuasive in a society in which, as a recent study of Japanese values shows,¹⁶ few people trust institutional religion.

It may be said, therefore, that although we are painfully ignorant of the development, activities, and influence of secretive Shinshū societies, our understanding of popular Japanese Buddhism today and in the future remains incomplete without some recognition of these groups and the functions they perform for their adherents.

¹⁶ See Kisala, "Asian Values Study," in this issue of the *Bulletin*, 65.