Kuden: The Oral Hermeneutics of Tendai Tantric Buddhism

Michael SASO

Beginning with the prolific works of Toganoo (1933 and 1937; Hakeda 1972; Kiyota 1978), a representative body of scholarly literature on Shingon tantric Buddhism has become readily available to the scholar of Japanese religion. For a variety of reasons, including the interests of Tendai scholars in the kengyō 顕教 or popular devotional aspects of Buddhism, and a tradition of guarding the mikkyō 密教 tantric texts more carefully than the Shingon monks of Mt. Kōya, equivalent translations of Tendai tantric materials are rare. A first report on the translation of such materials is given here.

Tendai mikkyō tantric meditations are learned in the form of kuden 口伝, orally transmitted rituals, a tradition just as abundant in truly esoteric tantric prayer as Tibetan or Japanese Shingon rituals of Mt. Kōya. In order to gain access to this rich hermeneutic tradition, it is necessary to receive tokudo 得 度 initiation and study with an Ajari master of Mt. Hiei. Due to the kindness of Rev. Yamada Etai, Abbott of Mt. Hiei and zasu 座主 of Tendai Buddhism in Japan, the tokudo rite was received, and permission granted to me in 1980 to study with the Ajari Master Ikuta Kōken. This devout and learned monk imparted the oral hermeneutics over a period of some seven years, from 1980 until the summer of 1987. The work of translating the siddham Sanskrit, the Chinese text, and the Japanese instructions for the four main rites of Japanese tantric Buddhism. i.e., the Jūhachi-dō十八道, Taizō-kai 胎蔵界, Kongōkai 金剛界, and Goma 護摩 Fire rite has been completed as this report goes to press. Some of the preliminary results from this study are presented here. with the recognition of the tentative nature of my findings, and the need of more than a lifetime of research to adequately describe the profound depths of this time honored sacred system so close to the well springs of Japanese Buddhism.1

¹ The founders of Kamakura period Buddhism, Nichiren, the Zen sects, Hönen (Pure Land), and Shinran were trained in the traditions of Tendai, where *nenbutsu* chant and Zen

Historians list some thirteen schools of tantric oral hermeneutics that existed on Mt. Hiei, from the time of Ennin's return from China in 847 C.E. to the present. Of these historical schools of tantrism only three remain active on Mt. Hiei today, namely: the Anoō穴太, Sanmai 三昧, and Hōman 法曼. Each of these traditions is represented by a group of Ajari teachers on Mt. Hiei, who pass on the oral tradition of tantric ritual meditation to the novices, and even to elderly monks who come to the mountain top for ordination. Custom demands that sixty days, called shugyō 修行, must precede the Kanchō 灌頂 rite of ordination. Only after these sixty days of harsh austerity and practice can novices be licensed as true Tendai monks and nuns.²

The sixty-day shugyō period is a grueling experience in austerity, and training in ritual meditation. Tendai espouses the theory of the "two wheels" or "two wings," i. e., esoteric tantric practices and exoteric popular devotions are considered to be two wheels or two wings that make the Tendai vehicle move or fly in a straight path, so thirty days are given to each of the mikkyō and kengyō (tantric and popular) traditions, with equal emphasis on each tradition. Celibacy, abstinence, fasting, and physical exercise are combined each day with the intensive training in popular and tantric rites. Since each of the monks and nuns who come to the top of Mt. Hiei for the shugyō experience have spent the prior five or six years in a strict monastic setting, usually in one of the many Tendai shrines that surround the foot of the mountain and nearby Kyoto city, most of the postulants for Tendai kanchō ordination are well-versed in the rituals and doctrines of popular devotional Tendai Buddhism. It is therefore especially for the mikkyō rites that the novices apply to enter the sixty-day training period on the mountain.

Though the transmission of tantric ritual practice must by its very nature be oral, i.e., mandala visualization, mantric chant, and mudrā hand dance can only be learned by doing, there are in fact a set of privately published wood block manuals for each of the three sects, that can and must be purchased by the novices before beginning the sixty days of austerity. There are three sets of manuals, called Shido gyōgi四度行記, one set for each of the three teaching traditions. The Anoō sect combines the four rites in a single folio volume, while the Sanmai and Hōman sects provide four volumes, one each for the Jūhachi-dō, Taizō-kai, Kongō-kai, and Goma Fire ritual. All three sets are purchased at a small specialized bookshop in Kyoto called the Shiba Kinseidō located just off Kawaramachi at Nijō, on the northeast corner of Nijō street. The Shiba family has been associated with reprinting Tendai woodblock and other materials for many generations, and reproduces the entire portfolio of Tendai kengyō and mikkyō books for scholarly and religious use.³

sitting in the form of taza-shikan 打坐止観 are still practiced.

² See Bukkyö Chinseki Kankökai 1982, vol. 4, for the Kanchö rite, and the various Tendai traditions.

³ The single volume Anoöryü Shido gyögi 1933 contains the clearest exposition of the kuden oral hermeneutic.

This study and translation of the Tendai mikkyō texts was undertaken with two goals in mind. The first goal, at the instigation of the Rev. Ara Ryōkan, Abbot of the Tendai Betsuin in Honolulu, was to provide an accurate and scholarly rendition of the Tendai tantric materials in English. English renditions of the equivalent Japanese Shingon and Tibetan tantric materials are readily available in Western paperback editions. The devotional or bhakti oriented Tendai texts are contained in one Japanese source, other than the Shido gyōgi series. The four volume Kokuyaku shōgyō taikei (Bukkyō Chinseki Kankōkai 1982) contains materials from the extensive private Tendai library located at the Sakamoto Eizan Bunko library near Lake Biwa. The series is expensive and must be ordered through bookshops specializing in Buddhist studies. An English edition of the Tendai Tantric rituals, which follows the oral hermeneutic tradition of the Ajari teachers of Mt. Hiei, was therefore approved to coincide with the 1200 year anniversary of the founding of the Enryaku-ji temple by Saichō, on Mt. Hiei's summit (787–1987).

The second goal of the translation, one close to my own specialization in the study of Taoist ritual and meditation, was to approach the translation and interpretation of esoteric materials—such as were found in the controversial Teachings of Taoist Master Chuang (Saso 1978)—from a fresh and objectively neutral standpoint. Rather than directly answer the objections to my use of oral tradition and myth to interpret Taoist rites, it seemed best to establish first a methodology for hermeneutic or interpretative translation of texts that relied on an oral rather than a strict dictionary-literal meaning. The use of this method, the direct, physical participation in the rituals and meditations, and the receiving of the oral instructions of a master of the tantric tradition, enhances and completes the sparse, laconic siddham Sanskrit and classical Chinese phrases of the Tendai texts. The correct translation of Taoist and tantric Buddhist texts requires adherence to an oral kuden tradition.

The transmission of the Tendai oral teachings, i.e., the instruction in tantric meditative liturgies, takes place during the last thirty days of the sixty-day shugyō trial. Each of the four meditations are performed twenty-one times, that is, three performances a day over a seven-day period are allotted to learn each ritual. The rites are performed at 2:00 A.M., 8:00 A.M. and 2:00 P.M. daily, in the presence of the Ajari master. Since as many as sixty young novices apply for each shugyō session, there are hardly enough Ajari masters to insure accurate and personal instruction.

The time required to translate and annotate the four rites was of course insufficient in the brief thirty days of *shugyō*. For this reason I was allowed instead to live at the foot of Mt. Hiei in the Bishamondō temple complex, the residence of the Ajari master Ikuta Kōken. This renowned monk, who

⁴ There are three shugyō sessions a year. On the average, a total of one hundred and eighty postulants apply annually, assuring that Tendai will flourish well into the twenty-first century.

resided in Mudō-ji temple on Mt. Hiei for some forty-three years, and has been a master of the Hōman tradition for the past twenty years, is now director of the ascetic training of the young monks in the tantric tradition before their sixty-day trial on the mountain top.

In order to translate the materials properly and receive a complete word-for-word transmission of the oral hermeneutic, I was required to perform the Jūhachi-dō Eighteen Path Maṇḍala meditation and the Goma Fire rite a total of thirty-six consecutive times, or until the two liturgies were perfectly mastered. At the same time I attempted to restore the siddham Sanskrit words to their original pronunciation, filtered through the phonetic Chinese character and recorded in kana phonetic transliteration. It was apparent, however, from the very beginning of the project that the Tendai version of the four maṇḍala meditations was significantly different from the Shingon texts and hermeneutics transmitted at Mt. Kōya. Some of the differences are discussed below.

The work of translating the Taizō-kai and Kongō-kai, the Lotus World and Vajra World Maṇḍalas, was begun in 1985 when I was again able to sit with the Ajari master Ikuta Kōken. In 1986 a yearlong grant was awarded by the Japan Foundation to complete the project. Five months were given to each of the meditations, two to three hours a day over a ten month period, in order to perform every element of the two great maṇḍala liturgies, as taught in the Hōman, Anoō, and Sanmai traditions. The Tendai texts and their interpretation when compared with parallel Shingon materials, proved to be significantly different in hermeneutic interpretation. I should like to address this point before pursuing the methodology of interpretative translation further.

Though historic precedent for rivalry between Tendai and Shingon Buddhism has lessened scholarly comparisons in pre-modern times, the advanced University system of modern Japan has provided new motivation and a broadening of comparative studies within the two great tantric traditions. Among the pioneers in tantric meditation research is the noted Shingon scholar Yamazaki Taikō, a professor of Kōya-san University and author of two books, one on the meditations of tantric Buddhism, and another on the doctrines of Shingon Buddhism (1974, 1981). This latter work, translated into English by Cynthia and Richard Peterson, (soon to be published by Shambala Press, Boston), provides a clear basis for comparing the rites of Tendai and Shingon Buddhism. Yamazaki most willingly helped me in formulating a list of differences and offered important advice in comparing the two systems. I summarize the findings briefly below.⁶

⁵ Among many other resources, Vol. 2 of the *Toganoo zenshū* (Toganoo 1985) was immensely helpful in this endeavor.

⁶ See Peterson 1987, translated and adapted from the Japanese work of Yamazaki Taikō. The following list is taken from a private conversation and notes taken with Yamazaki.

- 1. Though the external manner of performing the four mandala liturgies is quite similar, the internal meditations and therefore the oral hermeneutics are quite different as to details and composition of the eidetic (moving, creative) visualizations performed during the meditative process. The details for each meditation differ not only between Tendai and Shingon, but within each of the $ry\bar{u}$ \bar{m} or schools of the two sects as well.
- 2. The order of the *maṇḍala* meditations, as a rule, is reversed for Tendai and Shingon. The Shingon monks learn the Vajra *Maṇḍala* meditation first, and then the Lotus-Womb Matrix, while Tendai reverses this process:

Shingon: Jūhachi-dō, Kongō-kai, Taizō-kai, Goma, Kanchō; Tendai: Jūhachi-dō, Taizō-kai, Kongō-kai, Goma, Kanchō.

- 3. The reason for the reversal is due to the emphasis of Shingon on *siddhi* or "putting on" the aspects of the Buddhas encountered during the meditations, while Tendai emphasizes the *bhakti* or devotional aspects of the encounter. Thus for Tendai all *siddhi* are to be burned away during the *Goma* rite of fire, and therefore the power aspects of the Vajra World *Maṇḍala* are placed next to the fires of the Goma, protecting the *bhakti* devotional world of the Lotus *Maṇḍala*.
- 4. By the same token, the Vajra Mandala of Shingon Buddhism is seen as the source of wisdom, while the Lotus Mandala is source of reason. Tendai admits the distinction, taking the seed word AH to be source of the phenomenal world, when moving in an outward direction, but gateway to interior devotion in the opposite, liturgical use. Thus lady Lotus plants the seeds of enlightenment in the interior, while male Vajra gives the seeds away.
- 5. The basis for the above distinctions rests in the Shingon emphasis on the philosophy of Yogācara and the Tendai leaning towards the school of Mādhyamika. In the strictest Buddhist sense, neither of these schools are to be interpreted as metaphysics, so much as $up\bar{a}ya$, convenient skillful means to enlightenment through $mudr\bar{a}$, mantra, and mandala (shin-ku-i 身口意) i.e., interior tantric ritual meditation.

The scope of comparison is much too broad to be pursued further in a single report. I shall attempt to show here the goal of the Tendai version of the four liturgies, while recommending the English translation of Yamazaki's work and the French study of Tajima (1959) for further insight into the Shingon prayer tradition. All rivalries and sectarian differences disappear from within the meditative world of the tantric mandala meditations. In the final sense, the Chinese saying ta-t'ung hsiao-i 大同小異 (grand unity, insignificant differences) describes the two beautiful and powerful traditions.

The first of the meditations learned in the tantric process is the $J\bar{u}hachi-d\bar{o}$, a maṇdala meditative process found in the Chinese, but probably not in the Indian tradition. The $J\bar{u}hachi-d\bar{o}$ or Eighteen Path Mandala is used as a

rite of entrance into all tantric ritual, including the *Taizō-kai* Womb World, the *Kongō-kai* Vajra World, and the *Goma* Fire rite. The rite is divided into seven stages, as follows (see Saso 1987a):

- 1. The rites of purification, using water, light, and incense to purify the three sources of karmic deeds.
- 2. Announcing the rite and inviting the spirits to be present (shared with Taoist ritual in China) and pronouncing of vows.
- 3. The Samaya meditation in which the meditator interiorizes the entire Buddha, Lotus, and Vajra Worlds, and dons the armor of the Light King Kundalin.
- 4. The first All-seed word meditation, in which the meditator creates a sacred Tao-ch'ang 道場 area, and interiorizes the vision of Acala and Vairocana. Bells summon, and the hands formed in a chariot *mudrā* unite the eidetic vision with the meditator.
- 5. A puja offering of six items: pure water, powder incense, flowers or leaves, burning incense, rice, and flame, are given to the vision as symbols of the six $p\bar{a}ramit\bar{a}s$ -crossings. In the Mādhyamika philosophy, the six offerings of material things and their spiritual or phenomenal aspects (shih 実 and hsiang 相) are seen as the stuff from which enlightenment comes.
- 6. The experience of samādhi in which the meditator sees the Buddha heartmind, self, and all others as one process.
- 7. A second offering of the six items in thanks, and the exiting process, a reversal of stages 5 and 1.

The Taizō-kai Womb Maṇḍala and the Kongō-kai Vajra World Maṇḍala are inserted at step 4 of the Eighteen Path ritual with alterations in the Jūhachi-dō rubrics. The Goma Fire rite is inserted after step 5, as an independent ritual without significant alteration of the Eighteen Path text. Whereas the Shingon Goma consists of five stages, the Tendai rite has at least six fire meditations and fire immolations, as follows (Hōmanryū 1987):

- 1. The envisioning and burning away of Acala, Fudō Myō-ō.
- 2. The envisioning and burning away of Agni, identified with the Buddha Locana, and the seven sources of light (Ursa Major).
- 3. The envisioning and burning away of the thousand armed Avalokiteśvara, surrounded by the twenty-eight constellations.
- 4. The envisioning and burning away of Acala and Vairocana simultaneously, as seed word, *samaya* symbol, and visible figure.
- 5. The envisioning and burning away of the entire Dharma, Lotus, and Vajra Worlds.
- 6. The envisioning and burning away of the entire realm of folk religion, Shinto, Taoist, and Vedic deities.

At each of the six stages, the meditator binds the visions into the flames,

throws in all bad deeds, good deeds, and desires as offerings, and then dissolves the vision in the flames, leaving no attachment, not even ashes behind, as remnants of defiled heart or mind. After the sixth offering the meditator purifies the altar, and continues the Eighteen Path meditation from the sixth stage. The Eighteen Path Maṇḍala is performed alone on a daily basis, by many Tendai monks who follow the monastic tradition. With the Heart Sūtra, the twenty-fifth chapter of the Lotus Sūtra, and the Amida Sūtra, the Eighteen Path Maṇḍala meditation is at the very core of the devout Tendai monk's life.

It was abundantly clear to me from the beginning of the seven year study, until the finishing of the Lotus and Vajra World translations in the spring of 1987, that the oral hermeneutic was essential at every stage of the meditative process. I have chosen two examples to show the importance of the oral tradition as a tool for accurate and correct translation. The first example is taken from the *Goma* Fire rite, but applies to each of the eidetic visualizations of the four great *maṇḍala* meditations. In stage four of the *Goma* Fire rite, the Chinese text of the *Goma* gives the following instructions (Hōmanryū 1987, pp. 54–55).

In the center of the fire envision two lotus blossoms. In the center of the first blossom is the seed word AH, which transforms into Vairocana. In the center of the second lotus is the seed word KAM, which changes into the image of Acala.

The meditator is now told to burn away all the effects of karmic deeds by an interior fire, more powerful than the external flames of the Goma. The Goma flames burn away the wood and the seed offerings, leaving only ashes. But the interior flames of the Bodhi-enlightened heart-mind are like a sudden devouring fire that leaves behind no ashes. In the oral hermeneutic, the seed word KAM becomes first a samaya-symbol, a sword and then a flame, and lastly turns into Acala. Thus the seed word purifies the mind, the sword purifies the heart, and the image of Acala fills the entire body, cleansing the three sources of karmic action. The meditator then envisions his or her body to be one with the altar, the fire, and the Dharma body of Vairocana. All three, the flames, the self, and Vairocana, expand and fill the entire Dharma world, which for the Mādhyamika Tendai tradition is here interpreted to be neither arising nor annihilated. Separated by the flames and the vision from the world of words and images, the meditator sees self to be reborn into the realm of no-birth:

Meditating at the gateway of AH, all the seeds of desires are prevented. Entering into this violent cutting wisdom, a great light diffuses in all directions. Suddenly becoming a great burning flame the image of Acala arises, holding a sword in the right hand, and a rope in the left. The swirling flames devour karmic deeds, mental images, and the altar ves-

sels laden with $avidy\bar{a}$ ignorance, so that nothing remains, nothing is left (See Illustration).

The meditator now sees the flames to subside, and a pure compassionate water washes the body, flowing through every pore like sweet, white dew. A lotus flower of enlightenment opens in front of the meditator, and from the center issues five seed words, namely AH, RAM, KAM, and KEN. Again the words change into a samaya-symbol, seen as a stūpa. Finally the stūpa changes into Vairocana. The meditator now offers the four items to the left of the Goma altar, i.e., oil, red beans, white beans, and coarse rice, to Vairocana, by throwing these items into the flames. The coarse offerings represent all of the ego's evil karmic deeds, the oral hermeneutic teaches. Next six pure offerings, representing my good deeds, equally useless for enlightenment, are thrown into the flames. Soma oil, powder incense, grain incense, poppy seed, barley, and sesame seeds symbolize the five senses and intellect, and the six pāramitās. Finally the items to the left of the Goma altar, leaves for my desires of perfection, and twelve-inch long sticks of wood representing the twelve causes of enlightenment (also the twelve nidhānas, "twelvefold causes and conditions") are burned in the flames. The ultimate stage of the Goma is a total kenosis, a completely dark night of spirit and senses. Only when the flames go out, and nothing remains of self glory and merit, can the samādhi meditation of the Eighteen Path Mandala be experienced.

The eidetic meditations of Tendai tantric Buddhism must therefore be interpreted to be a threefold process wherein the vision of a seed word (to purify the mind) changes into a symbol or samaya (to purify the heart) and finally into an eidetic or moving image so as to attain union with an aspect of the Dharmakāya body of the Buddha. Whether the image is of Acala, Amida, Vairocana, or some other form of the enlightened Buddha, is not important. The meditator must not become attached to the vision, in fact must burn all images away in the invisible fires of the Vajra World's thunder and lightning, as well as the real fire of the Goma. This meditative process is preeminently a part of the oral hermeneutic called kuden.

The process of kenotic union cannot be completed before passing through the two great mandala meditations of the Lotus and Vajra Worlds, a system not found as a related process in India or Tibet but essential to both the Shingon and the Tendai traditions. In the latter Tendai version of the two rites, the Lotus liturgy is essentially seen as a process of "putting on" the armor and compassionate aspects of a meditating enlightenment-oriented Vairocana. The process is mediated by the light king Acala. Twelve surrounding halls protect the attainment of bodhi-enlightenment, from within an eight-petalled lotus where Vairocana sits, forming the samādhi-zen mudrā. As the meditator attains union with Vairocana the four gates of the Lotus



Illustration by John Casey and Michael Saso.

mandala are locked, making a true womb matrix from whence enlightenment is born. Thus the Tendai Lotus World is called the "female" or yin aspect of enlightenment. The meditator moves in a clockwise interior direction towards purity and illumination (see Saso 1987b).

The Vajra liturgy is necessarily the "male" or yang aspect of tantric process meditation. Whereas the Lotus locked the gates of the heart and attained union with a meditating Vairocana, the Vajra opens the gates of an awakened interior, and gives the light of salvation to all sentient beings through the meditating process of Amida, in an outward counterclockwise motion. It is especially from within the nine assemblies of the Vajra meditations that the inspiration of later Japanese Buddhist movements can be found. Whereas Acala brings light to the interior of the Lotus, Amida gives forth light from the center of the Vajra. This process too is a part of the oral hermeneutic peculiar to the Tendai tradition (see Saso 1987c).

Recalling that images in the tantric meditative tradition are considered to be upāya (hōben 方便) or a skillful means to attain kenotic emptying, let us pause to look for a moment at the process of eidetic imaging that takes place in the Vajra World Mandala. The light king Gozanze 降三世 (Trailokyavijaya) appears first as a terrifying figure purifying the meditator from any hint of selfish perfection. Trailokyavijaya soon turns into Samantabhadra and then Vajrasattva, becoming eventually a female, and then a male version of Amida. all of these visions are samaya-symbols of the meditator who has taken on the heart of giving-compassion. Samantabhadra, or Fugen 普賢, gives eternal wisdom. Vajrasattva, the first avatar-disciple of Vairocana, effudes the purifying light of salvation. Turned into the gentle and compassionate Amida, who rules from the upper quadrant of the Vajra center, the light of saving grace is spread to all sentient beings without any merit of self or others. When the meditator "spreads" or "gives away" the merits of the Vajra World, it is not by his own deeds or meditations, but by the light of Vairocana (Amida-Vajrasattva). The mudrā of the central Vairocana figure shows an empty left hand (the meditator) filled with the sword-vajra right hand of Vairocana. The four surrounding figures, Vairasattva (Thunderenlightened), Vajra Jewel, Amida, and the Vajra-deer (i.e., the historical Buddha) teach that "saving compassion" is indeed the way to kenotic emptying of the self.

The path of Japanese Buddhism away from the complexities of tantric meditation into the simplicity of Zen, Pure Land chant to Amida, and Shimran's final act of pure faith in the saving grace of Amida was historically conditioned by and born in the seed words and envisioning process meditations of Tendai Buddhism. This gradual path towards simplicity, a spiritual as well as a historical process, is sung in one of the verses of the Vajra meditation

The storehouse consciousness, by origin unsullied, Is pure and clean, no stain or falsity therein. To dwell always with true blessing and wisdom Is to see my heart-mind as a pure, round moon. No substance, no distractions allowed there. Indeed, there is no moon there either. It is due to making blessings real for others That my heart-mind is empty, like the pure full moon. Skipping and dancing, the heart is filled with joy. Repeatedly it chants to the heavenly worthies, "Now I have seen indeed my true heart-mind! It is pure and clean, like a full round moon!" (Saso 1987c, p. 3)

The kuden oral tradition of Tendai Buddhism is based firmly on the Mādhyamika teaching of the empty middle way. Neither affirming or denying the real (shih 寒) or the phenomenal (hsiang 相), the meditator in the Tendai tantric tradition is taught to burn away and empty all images, whether in the form of seed words, samaya-symbols, or icons, until nothing, not even the ashes of the Goma Fire, remains. In this sense, the goal of the Zen-shikan 禅 (打坐) 止觀 meditation, the nenbutsu chant念仏, and the mudrā-mantramandala (shin-ku-i) tantric rites of Tendai Buddhism each have the same goal, that is, the emptying of the mind, filling the heart with devotion, and the uniting of the entire self with the heart of the Buddha.

REFERENCES

BUKKYŌ CHINSEKI KANKŌKAI 仏教珍籍刊行会, cd.

1982 Kokuyaku shōgyō taikei. Taimitsu-bu 国訳聖教大糸 · 台密部 [Taimitsu section of the Japanese translation of the sacred teachings], 4 vols. Tokyo: Kokusho Kankōkai (first published 1932, reprint 1975).

HAKEDA, Yoshito

1972 Kukai: Major Works. New York: Columbia University Press.

HŌMANRYŪ

1987 Goma shigi 護摩私記 [Private edition of the Goma Rite, Hōman sect]. Kyoto: Shiba Kinseidō (woodblock photo reprint).

KIYOTA, Minoru

1978 Shingon Buddhism: Theory and Practice. Los Angeles and Tokyo: Buddhist Books International.

PETERSON, Cynthia and Richard, transls.

1987 Shingon: Japanese Esoteric Buddhism. Boston: Shambala Press.

SUGITANI Jikai

1933 Anoō shido gyōgi 穴太四度行記 [The Anoō four rites of Tendai tantric Buddhism]. Kyoto: Shiba Kinseidō.

TOGANOO Shōun 栂尾祥雲

- 1933 Mikkyō bukkyō shi 密教仏教史 [The history of tantric Buddhism]. Kōya-san: Kōya-san University Press (Naigai Insatsu).
- 1937 Mandara no kenkyū 曼荼羅の研究 [Studies on maṇḍala]. Kōya-san: Kōya-san University Press.
- 1985 Toganoo zenshū 栂尾全集 [Collected works of Toganoo Shōun], 6 vols. Kyoto: Rinsen Shoten.

TAJIMA Ryūjun

1959 Les Deux Grands Mandalas et la Doctrine de L'Esoterisme Shingon. Tokyo: Kasai Publishing Co., Maison Franco-Japonaise.

SASO, Michael

- 1978 Teachings of Taoist Master Chuang. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- 1987a The Goma Fire Rite. MS edition.
- 1987b The Lotus World Meditations. MS edition.
- 1987c The Vajra World Meditations. MS edition.

YAMAZAKI Taikō 山崎泰広

- 1974 Mikkyō meisō hō 密教瞑想法 [Secret meditation techniques of Shingon Buddhism]. Kyoto: Nagata Bunshōdō.
- 1981 Mikkyō meisō to shinsō shinri 密教瞑想と深層心理 [Shingon meditative techniques and depth psychology]. Kyoto: Shogensha.