

## Book Reviews

---

### **The Beginning of Heaven and Earth: The Sacred Book of Japan's Hidden Christians**

Translated and Annotated by Christal Whelan

Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 1996, xii+135pp.

---

*Reviewed by Margaret L. Cloherty,  
Washington, D.C.*

The first two chapters of *The Beginning of Heaven and Earth* (*Tenchi hajimari no koto*) relate the creation, the fall and entry of original sin into the world, the spread of evil and the flood, albeit with some syncretism and Japanese folk material. In the creation myth, some of the heavens are derived from Buddhist cosmology. In addition God creates the elements for several religions—earth, water, fire and wind (Buddhism); salt (Shinto and Christianity) and oil (Christianity). Whelan points out that the story of the flood is reminiscent of Japanese legend. God sends a *tsunami* to destroy the sinful people. Pope-Martyr (Noah) escapes with six of his children in a canoe but has to leave behind a lame son. A lion-dog miraculously delivers the seventh son.

The remaining 13 chapters relate lives of the Virgin Mary and Jesus that are structured around the rosary. In contrast to scripture, which offers limited information about Mary, *Tenchi's* Mary is a well-developed character, thanks in part to embellishments from European legends. After deciding to remain a virgin, Mary rejects the marriage proposal and treasure of the King of Luzon, with a prayer that is answered by a miracle. Snow falls in the heat of summer (Italian

legend of Our Lady of the Snows) and a flower wagon takes her to heaven, where she is crowned. Mary consents to return to earth to bear the savior, and in rapid succession the story moves through the annunciation, visitation, nativity and finding in the temple. *Tenchi* has no knowledge of Joseph; Mary raises Jesus herself.

The content of the Jesus story is also eclectic and the events are out of sequence. After his birth in a cold stable, the infant Jesus is warmed by the breath of cows and horses (from the Apocryphal Infancy Gospel of Matthew). Jesus is baptized by his cousin John. Jesus sees God face-to-face on Mt. Tabor (presumably the Transfiguration), is ordained and goes into the forest to study under Sacrament (SIC), who has descended from heaven to serve as His tutor. When Jesus is twelve years old Mary finds him in the temple debating with a Buddhist teacher, whom he bests, converts and baptizes along with twelve disciples. The Galilean ministry is missing and Jesus' teaching ministry is limited to mention of his travel to Rome to build and teach about salvation at the glittering church of St. Ecclesia. Meanwhile King Herod, who decades before had 44,444 infants killed in an unsuccessful attempt to kill Jesus, at last pays Judas to betray Jesus. The agony begins when Deusu sends Jesus an oracle saying that he must suffer and die lest the souls of the murdered infants forfeit the opportunity to go to paradise (possibly an allusion to the souls of unbaptized infants in Limbo). At Herod's behest, Pontius and Pilate join a crowd that goes to capture Jesus. The scourging, crown of thorns, carrying of the cross (with the Veronica legend) and crucifixion beside the good and bad thieves ensue. Jesus is laid in the coffin,

rises from the dead, and on the third day ascends to heaven. The resurrection appearance is only for the purpose of instructing Peter. Mary is assumed into heaven. All ends well as Jesus brings the murdered infants and other good people to heaven, where the various saints are assigned duties; the end of the world is foretold; and purgatory is explained.

"In the beginning Deusu was worshiped as Lord of Heaven and Earth, and Parent of humankind and all creation. Deusu has 200 ranks and 42 forms, divided the light that was originally one and made the Sun Heaven and twelve other heavens. The names of these heavens are Benbo or Hell, Manbo, Oribeten, Shidai, Godai, Pappa, Oroha, Konsutanchi, Hora, Koroteru, and a hundred thousand Paraiso and Gokuraku." So begins Christal Whelan's English translation of this sacred text expressing the beliefs and faith practices of rural, mostly illiterate Hidden Christians (*Kakure Kirishitan*) in a region northwest of Nagasaki during the suppression of Christianity from 1614 until 1858. Christal Whelan's book contributes to scholarship on *Tenchi* by making the text available to readers beyond a small group of scholars and by providing the extensive notes and commentary necessary to interpret it. The notes and commentary are more than twice the length of the text of *Tenchi*.

Whelan has translated the Japanese edition of the text of Ebisawa Arimichi, which in turn is a reconstruction of the Zen (Shimomura Zenzaburo, dated 1818-1830) and Hatakeda (dated 1827) manuscripts. Both manuscripts are characterized by their graceful style and calligraphy. In her translation, Ms. Whelan has used short, simple sentences and dropped the Japanese honorifics. Even so, the first time through *Tenchi* is difficult reading due to its eclectic content—a blend of diverse and often obscure or confused Christian, Buddhist, Japanese legends, folk wisdom and other material. The reader also must stop fre-

quently to flip to notes in the back of the book due to the rendering of Portuguese and Latin words in their Japanese phoneticized spellings. For example, San Jiwan refers to John the Baptist, San Maruya to Mary, and Jusukiri to Lucifer. These renderings do achieve the translator's purpose of retaining the flavor of the language the Hidden Christians used to express their faith but at some cost in ease of comprehension. This reader suggests that any future edition add a glossary of these words in Japanese, Portuguese, Latin and English.

Whelan's Introduction summarizes the familiar history of Japan's early encounter with Christianity, the events that led to its suppression, and the origins and the use of *Tenchi*. Space permits us to touch on only a few points related to the latter two subjects. *Tenchi* originally may have been a pleasant story or chant. Due to the lack of other Christian materials, over time it became central to preserving and giving structure to the religion of the Hidden Christians. The text was made more formal in tone and recorded in manuscripts that were accorded the status of sacred writings. Its precise role in community worship remains obscure. Whelan suggests it may have been used during prayer gatherings, possibly involving the rosary; the joyful, sorrowful and glorious mysteries of the rosary are part of its warp and woof.

The highlight of the Introduction is Whelan's research findings from eleven months of fieldwork among *Kakure Kirishitan* in the Goto Islands during 1991-1992. Her research suggests that many contemporary *Kakure Kirishitan* appreciate the *Tenchi* for the role it played in keeping Christianity alive and for the tie it gives them to their past. Nevertheless, they do not regard it as sacred scripture. It is not possible here to do justice to Whelan's discussion of the reasons for *Tenchi's* decline and it is well worth looking up in her book. In short, the decline began with the return of the missionaries

and deepened as contact with outsiders exposed the Hidden Christians to richer and more authoritative Christian and Buddhist teachings, resources and opportunities for worship.

Whelan's extensive annotations represent prodigious research in several fields and are essential to interpreting the text. They delve into *Tenchi's* multilingual lexicon and trace the likely origin of much obscure material in the text that comes from diverse religious traditions and folk practices over many centuries. The cumulative effect of the notes is to persuade the reader that *Tenchi* is a primarily Christian document despite the inclusion of much extraneous material. For example, the notes show that based on *Tenchi*, we can tell that the Portuguese Catholic missionaries taught the Japanese Christians not only the sacraments, Latin prayers and Bible stories but also meditations on the rosary, stations of the cross, anecdotes from apocryphal works, such as the Book of James, and pious ancient and medieval legends.

Whelan's Introduction and notes helpfully point out areas where *Tenchi's* theology is confused. A key point of confusion that is worth noting is the Trinity. The unity of the Trinity is sacrificed when Deusu divides in half for the Incarnation. After the resurrection of Jesus and the Assumption of Mary, a Trinitarian formula explains that Deusu, who had originally been one, has become three bodies. Deusu is the Father, Jesus is the Son, and Mary is the Holy Spirit. Notwithstanding this statement, this author is less convinced than Whelan that Mary "becomes one of the persons of the Trinity" (31), at least not in the sense of the Roman Catholic Church's teaching about the Trinity. The *Tenchi* specifies that in heaven Deusu is the Father, the Son is the Savior, and Mary's role is Mediator—her traditional role. The sanctifying function of the Holy Spirit appears to be unknown in *Tenchi*; the descent of the Holy Spirit at

Pentecost does not occur. Mary appears to have no divine power in her own right; for example, the miracle she shows the King of Luzon comes in response to her prayers.

---

### **The Recovery of Mission: Beyond the Pluralist Paradigm**

Vinoth Ramachandra

Grand Rapids: Wm B. Eerdmans

Publishing Company, 1996, xii+293 pp.

---

*Reviewed by J. Nelson Jennings,  
Tokyo Christian University, Chiba*

This is an outstanding book and I hope that many, many people will read and study it with the care that it deserves. The strength of this work lies in how the author, Sri Lankan evangelical Vinoth Ramachandra, seeks a missiological approach to the issue of religious pluralism. As Ramachandra points out in the preface, he is *not* trying to produce another "Asian theology" (x). Rather, as the title indicates, the attempt is to retrieve a proper sense of mission that emerges out of the life and ministry of Jesus; a perspective that all too often has been blunted by modern theological attempts to deal with the allegedly new issue of religious pluralism. Ramachandra draws positively on his own non-Western, Asian background here to point out that the newness of pluralism is only in relation to a Western Christendom that only recently has entered into meaningful interaction with other faiths, especially since the 1960s. Because theological provincialism insists on asking, "Can anything good emerge beyond Europe and North America?", the fact that the author is not a Westerner will unfortunately keep some readers from taking this book seriously—especially those who most need to heed his message! Ramachandra's object is to interact with the worldwide Christian discussion on religious pluralism, which he does in a way

that engages both Western and various non-Western premises in a creative and constructive fashion.

The book is divided into three parts. Part I deals with three Asian churchmen who have made significant contributions worldwide to the formation of typical, modern theological approaches to pluralism. Ramachandra has entitled the three chapters that respectively consider these globally recognized theologians as "Mystery-Centred Faith: Stanley Samartha," "Liberating Gnosis: Raimundo Panikkar" and "Christic Theandrim: Aloysius Pieris." I find the respective treatments fair and honestly critical, as well as helpful introductions to readers unfamiliar with these three giants' lives and thought.

Part II has two chapters, entitled "Interweavings" and "Engaging Modernity." The former chapter begins by pulling together both different and common concerns of the three theologians considered in Part I. It then turns to "The Wider Landscape" in order "to explore some of the common ground between the Asian Christian writers whose work we have been examining and significant trends in the European tradition, especially developments in the latter which have taken place in the past two hundred years as the church in Europe has interacted with the dominant culture of modernity" (116). Three themes are examined: "The Turn to the Subject," "The Flight from History" and "Ultimate Silence." Chapter 5 then deals appreciatively with the work of Leslie Newbigen, specifically with his theological critique of modern secular culture, "Gospel of Public Truth." This chapter alone is worth the price of the book, offering the conclusion that Newbigen's "historical judgments need to be augmented by other perspectives, and the political dimensions of the 'tradition of rationality' created by the gospel require further exploration.... [Newbigen] has also shown how the painful and unnecessary divide between conservatives and liberals in the church may—and indeed must be—

bridged if the church is to have any credibility in a fragmented world" (171–72). This closing statement whets the reader's appetite for Ramachandra's own positive proposal set forth in Part III.

Chapter 6, "The Scandal of Jesus," seeks to recover the power of the original controversy over who Jesus is, particularly in light of his resurrection. Chapter 7, "A Gospel for the World," looks historically at the Christian mission movement and its various (including both ancient and modern) interactions with indigenous thought. I am impressed by the way Ramachandra concisely confronts the problem all peoples have, upon entering the Christian faith, of seeking to understand their own histories in relation to the salvific role of Old Covenant Israel: "While Yahweh works in all nations, in no nation other than Israel did he act for the sake of all nations" (231). There is also a healthy treatment of communal, socio-political concerns. The final chapter, "Gospel Praxis," suggests a proactive gospel mission approach under the rubrics of "humanity" "integrity," and "radicalness."

The book is not difficult to read, although that by no means is to suggest it is "light reading." As a glance at the bibliography will attest, Ramachandra draws on worldwide resources (including two of the leading contemporary African Christian thinkers, Lamin Sanneh and Kwame Bediako), as well as extra-Christian perspectives. While distinctively Christian, this work nevertheless seeks to be comprehensive in dealing with the multi-faceted subject of mission in our contemporary, globalized world. Please read it and use it for study with others. As John Stott's cover endorsement puts it: "This is the mind-stretching and heartwarming book on mission that we have been waiting for."

**Ministry & Theology in Global Perspective: Contemporary Challenges for the Church**

Don A. Pittman, Ruben L.F. Habito, Terry C. Muck, eds.  
Grand Rapids, MI: Wm.B. Eerdmans, 1996.  
524 pp., Paperback

---

*Reviewed by J. Nelson Jennings,  
Tokyo Christian University, Chiba*

Certain works demand a prominent and accessible place in any theological library. *Ministry & Theology in Global Perspective: Contemporary Challenges for the Church* belongs to that category. More than a sit-down read, it is a reference work that speaks to a wide range of issues in our globalized context for Christian ministry. Pittman, Habito and Muck themselves represent a spectrum covering mainline Protestantism, Roman Catholicism and Evangelicalism. As editors, they have assembled an even broader group of contributors who represent all continents, both early (e.g., Justin Martyr and Augustine) and more recent periods of Christian history, as well as various religious perspectives. Such a range is in accord with the comprehensive coverage the editors have attempted to provide for readers interested in ministering in relevant ways heading into the twenty-first century.

After a stimulating introduction describing "The Global Context for Ministry," the first part of the book seeks to work "Toward a Christian Theology of Religions." The bulk of Part I is a compilation of readings from well-known writers representing "Pre-Twentieth-Century Christian Views," "Contemporary Roman Catholic and Eastern Orthodox Views" and "Contemporary Protestant Views." To have in one volume such a varied lineup of household names on this vital subject is helpful to anyone seeking to formulate his own views on world religions.

Part II then takes the reader through a set of questions and issues dealing with "Mission and Ministry." The essence, reason, subject, object, location, method, and enemies of mission are considered in various forms by such figures as Pope John Paul II, Lamin Sanneh and David Bosch. The book's third part explores ministry in relation to "dialogue," moving in turn through "The Why and How of Dialogue," "Fruits of Dialogue," and the "Tasks for Interreligious Cooperation." The index for subjects and names, as well as one for scriptural references, will facilitate use of the book on an ongoing basis for particular concerns and topics.

We all live in an increasingly globalized world. Even so, many of us in the Christian faith still find it difficult, on the one hand, to grapple with the new challenges brought on by globalization and, on the other hand, to benefit from the worldwide forum for dealing with those new challenges in innovative ways. This volume compiled by Pittman, Habito and Muck should prove to be a valuable tool for helping us overcome stubborn provincialism, as well as for enabling us to draw on the wealth of resources available for the furthering of Christian ministry.

---

**Salvationist Samurai: Gunpei Yamamuro and the Rise of the Salvation Army in Japan**

R. David Rightmire  
Lanham, Maryland: Scarecrow Press,  
1997, 166 pp.

---

*Reviewed by Patrice Van Hyle,  
Tokyo*

R. David Rightmire, recognized as a major interpreter of Salvation Army history and theology, received his Ph.D in historical

theology from Marquette University in Milwaukee, Wisconsin. Having spent much of his own youth in Japan as the son of Salvation Army officers, Rightmire is in a unique position, due to his language ability and cultural sensitivity, to write the first scholarly book in English on Gunpei Yamamuro, the "Salvationist Samurai." Through his use of previously untapped Japanese materials from archives and libraries in Japan, England and the United States, the author contributes significantly to a global understanding of the Salvation Army, of Japanese religious history and the history of Christian mission. The character of Salvation Army Commissioner Gunpei Yamamuro, organizer, evangelist, writer and theologian, is portrayed through captivating accounts that bring to life not only the individual but also the surrounding social and political climate that existed in Meiji and pre-World War II Japan.

Chapter one opens with a description of the Meiji era in Japan (1868–1912). This "enlightened era" (2) was a time of modernization and political reform following Japan's 200-year self-imposed isolation from the outside world. The 1870s brought a "permissive attitude toward Christianity" (4) on the part of the Japanese government due to the latter's desire to gain acceptance among Western nations and to eradicate unequal treaties with Western powers. It was a period of social upheaval and transition as Japan found itself exposed to many new ideas from the West.

In the midst of this great expansion towards the West, the first contingent of Salvation Army officers, made up of missionaries from England, New Zealand, Australia, Ireland and America, arrived in Yokohama on September 4, 1895. Sent by Salvation Army founder General William Booth, the Salvationists immediately adopted the Army's "native policy" (15) employed in other mission territories. Commanding officer Colonel Edward Wright explained

the policy in an interview granted soon after arrival, "We shall adopt Japanese means, Japanese dress, and the Japanese mode of life...it is our intention to live as the common people of Japan live" (16). Although the initial period of the Army's mission in Japan was difficult due to "misguided attempts at identification with Japanese culture" (16), within the space of twelve years the Salvation Army rose from relative obscurity to national recognition, proving particularly adept at "culturally adapting its mission to the needs of Japan's emerging industrialized society" (xiii). This was for the most part due to the efforts and insights of Gunpei Yamamuro.

Chapter two focuses on the main character of the book, Gunpei Yamamuro—his family background, spiritual search and eventual acquaintance with and induction into the Salvation Army. Born the eighth and last child of a peasant farming family in 1872, it almost seems that from the time of childhood, Yamamuro's path was predestined. His first name, Gunpei, means "soldier of peace" in English (19). Moreover his pious mother, particularly interested in having her son lead a life dedicated to the service of humankind, made a solemn vow to abstain from eating eggs ("the best source of nourishment available") in return for God's blessing of Gunpei with maturity and usefulness (20). From early on, Gunpei was attracted to the ideals of self-denial and self-discipline and after a spiritual exploration and subsequent disillusionment with the tenets of Confucianism, he realized that "the source of power to overcome his human weaknesses was to be found in Christ" (24).

Yamamuro's concern for the spiritual welfare of the lower classes in industrialized Meiji Japan steadily grew and caused him to clash with Christian leaders of the day who seemed to dwell more on theological and intellectual doctrines that appealed to a privileged elite. Upon reading the Salvation

Army manual "Orders and Regulations for Soldiers," written by William Booth, Yamamuro's life-long search for a practical Christianity reached an end. Gunpei was convinced he had been providentially led to the Army so that his "life's ambition and consecration—the preaching of the salvation of God to the common people"—might be realized (35). "An organization that deliberately embraced poverty must be pure and that was part of the Salvation Army's attraction for me," wrote Yamamuro (36). He was accepted as a cadet in 1895 and in 1896 was commissioned as a lieutenant, becoming the first native officer of the Salvation Army in Japan. In 1899 Gunpei married Kiye Sato, a highly educated woman of noble birth who was also greatly attracted to the Army's method of mission and ministry to the poor. Kiye aided Yamamuro in his literary work as well as in his social crusades until her death in 1917.

The following three chapters highlight the religious career of Gunpei Yamamuro and the simultaneous development of the Salvation Army in Japan. It is the premise of this book that Gunpei's personal influence on the Army—his moral, intellectual and literary contributions, enabled it to flourish and attract supporters from all strata of Japanese society, from the emperor to the homeless squatter living on the street. Yamamuro's fame spread in 1897 when he was appointed editor of the Army publication *War Cry* (*Toki no koe*). Yamamuro immediately began using colloquial Japanese to reach poor people, discontinuing the use of classical Japanese. Within five years, circulation exceeded ten thousand copies biweekly. "Thus it became Yamamuro's task to clearly communicate the Army's message and mission to the people of Japan" (47). Of all his literary works, Gunpei's *Common People's Gospel* (*Heimin no fukuin*), published in 1899, had the most widespread appeal and was considered by Christian social reform-

ers to be "a masterpiece of religious literature in the Meiji era" (59).

Gunpei Yamamuro's gifts as a communicator and public speaker were not confined to Japan. Travelling all over the world as an invited guest, Yamamuro became known for his powerful addresses and moving sermons "drawing large crowds and winning numerous converts" (55). He was also a staunch defender of abstinence from alcohol and organized the Japan National Temperance Movement. His anti-prostitution campaign of 1900 challenged an institution with deep roots in Japanese society and risked the lives of many Salvation officers who valiantly fought against the "evils of licensed prostitution" (83). In one year alone, thousands of women responded to Yamamuro's invitation, fled from the brothels and sought asylum in Salvation Army rehabilitation homes.

All in all, under the leadership of Gunpei Yamamuro, the Salvation Army in Japan increased from 110 corps and 270 Japanese officers and cadets in the 1920s to 147 corps and 500 Japanese officers and cadets in the 1930s; averaging several thousand Japanese converts annually. The Army, known as the "Yamamuro sect" (51), expanded its ministry to prison work, children's homes, slum posts, prostitute's and run-away girls' rescue homes, cheap lodgings for the poor and unemployed and hospitals. The last two chapters of the book deal with the relationship between the Salvation Army in Japan and state authorities, including the emperor, and describe how a positive spirit of collaboration between the two entities enabled the Army to freely pursue its mission goals and aims until the outbreak of World War II. During the Russo-Japanese War (1904–1905), the Japanese government sought unity at home, thus putting "Christian loyalty to the state" to the test (108). While boosting national consciousness, the war confronted Japanese Christians with the issue of national allegiance. Visiting sick

and wounded Japanese soldiers in military hospitals and ministering to the families of Japanese soldiers killed in the war, the Salvation Army effectively demonstrated its "loyalty to the nation" (108) during the Russo-Japanese War. Following Japan's victory the Army opened an employment bureau for war veterans, the first of its kind in Japan, again manifesting its service to both "God and emperor" (108, 109). In 1907, a time when military men were heroes of the day, General William Booth visited Japan. The Japanese public viewing him as a representative of Great Britain, Japan's alliance partner, "turned out by the thousands to see and hear him wherever he went" (112, 113).

Moreover, Booth became the first Christian clergyman, foreign or Japanese, to be granted an imperial audience with Emperor Meiji. Thus it was clear that the "state officially recognized the Army, viewing it as an organization useful in combatting the social evils of industrialized Japanese society as well as promoting respect for the emperor and national morality" (110). Imperial recognition led other branches of the government to support the Army in the form of subsidies at the national, prefectural and municipal levels. By the mid-1920s, ten percent of the Army's social work budget was paid for by government subsidies. In return, the Japanese government enlisted the help of the Army in welfare projects, such as distributing rice to the poor after the Tokyo rice riots of 1918, training urban families in agricultural skills and opening homes for the children of leper parents. Following the Great Kantō Earthquake of 1923, the Army mobilized an emergency relief program similar to the one it had led during the Tōhoku famine of 1905–1906, thereby "winning the hearts and acclamation of many Japanese" (99).

In 1926 Yamamuro was appointed territorial commander of Japan, making him the second non-Western officer to hold such a post in the Salvation Army and the first to

reach the rank of commissioner. According to Rightmire, the remarkable growth of the Army during the early twentieth century owed much to Yamamuro's ability to infuse the Salvation Army in Japan with "a spirit of nationalism." His article, "Bushido and the Salvation Army: Some Lessons from the Japanese Samurai," likened the Army's missiological methods and message to the traditional code of the samurai warrior outlining the virtues commonly held by both: "loyalty, bravery, perseverance, self-denial, obedience, honor and sacrifice."

Unfortunately the 1930s in Japan saw the rise of ultranationalism and the apparent "incompatibility of a dual allegiance to both emperor and general" (153). Japan's imperialistic expansion, propelled by nationalistic fervor, heightened the vulnerability of Japanese Salvationists who wanted to maintain "both international and national commitments" (155). Because of its British connection, the Army quickly came under suspicion from superpatriotic groups, including the press, while dissension broke out within its own ranks. Some factions wanted to cut off ties with England; others led by Yamamuro advocated a more moderate stance. Attempting to quell opposition to the Army's policy of internationalism, Yamamuro in 1937 wrote a tract "Defense of the Salvation Army's Stand," but this proved insufficient to reestablish unity within the Army. Yamamuro died of pneumonia just months before the Army was dismantled in 1940, at which time police raided territorial headquarters in Tokyo, arresting and imprisoning 30 Japanese Salvationists for espionage. The Army was forced to sever its ties with Britain, the *War Cry* was discontinued and, three years later, the state disbanded the Army altogether and confiscated its property.

In 1956 the Japanese government named Gunpei Yamamuro one of the "greatest social workers in Japanese history" (164). I consider this book, written to commemorate

the Salvation Army's centennial celebration in Japan 1895–1995, as required reading for all Christian missionaries in Japan and Christian historians.

---

**Christian Missions and the Judgment of God (Second Edition)**

David Macdonald Paton  
Grand Rapids: Wm B. Eerdmans  
Publishing Company, 1996, 114 pp.

---

*Reviewed by John E. Schmidt,  
Kobe*

*Christian Missions and the Judgment of God*, first published in 1953, has come to be considered one of the classic works on modern mission. In it Paton speaks to the church's task of living out the Great Commission and raises provocative questions regarding God's role in the Communist expulsion of missionaries from China. This book is now available in a new edition, which includes not only the entire original text but also an added introduction, a biography and a bibliographical section.

This new edition seems to be an oddly proportioned book. Paton's original work is short, only 67 pages long in the current edition. However, the biography (written by his son, David M. M. Paton) and the introduction (written by Bob Whyte) expand the book by an additional 36 pages, over half the length of the original work. Although helpful in a limited way, introductory material of this length is an unwelcome delay to entering the discussion of the main text.

Paton's work itself is still fresh and challenging. Although his focus is upon China in particular, and his original intended audience Anglican, there are few points in the book that seem parochial or inapplicable to a broader context. Far from it, modern readers will likely find much in this book that

directly addresses issues in their own national or denominational context.

Paton divides his subject into three chapters: "The Christian Mission Today," "Missions under Judgment" and "Looking Ahead." In the first chapter Paton presents a theology of mission and looks at political events of the day (particularly in China) through this Christian lens. He calls us to a faith that is not so much a series of propositions but one that is a record of what God does for the salvation of the world. Since all of the world (and not just religious life) is God's the turbulent processes of history are the scene of the unfolding of the purposes of God.

(God's) world is one world. But because he is greater than we can conceive, his workings will not be highly intelligible; because we are sinners, they will be to us frequently both disconcerting and uncomfortable; and because all the universe is his, he will be found in the secular as well as the religious world, in Communist China as well as in Oxford or Tunbridge Wells. He will, in fact, appear to us in judgment; and the executors of his judgment may surprise us.

Paton then asserts that God's judgment is being executed upon the church by political movements that are anti-Christian. Their harsh condemnation and persecutions are instruments of God's wrath and will cleanse the church of much of what has been hindering obedience. In the long run this cleansing expresses the mercy of God, as well.

The second chapter focuses on the problems attending Christian missions that have brought on God's judgment. While acknowledging that there is much good in the mission efforts of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, he unblinkingly focuses on the weaknesses. Chief among them lies the claim that Christian missions have been far too much a part of the imperialist aggression

of the West. Missionary rights and freedoms in China were the result of treaties extorted from unwilling Chinese authorities. Most missionaries maintained a Western standard of living, and church leaders became those who had attained the means to acquire a Western education and outlook. Institutions mimicked their Western counterparts. Ultimately, whatever the desires of the missionaries were, their actual policies precluded the development of a dynamic, self-governing church. This multifaceted failure became the root of the criticisms leveled against the church by the communists in China. More importantly, this failure brought on the judgment of God.

The final chapter focuses on the future prospects for missions. China is seen as an extreme example of a global trend. Paton sees increasing restrictions in store for the traditional patterns of mission that depend on Anglo-Saxon power and benevolence. In general, missionaries have not taken the transitory nature of their enterprise seriously enough. Although evangelism and the witness of the church extend to the last day, this doesn't mean that missionary work extends to the last day. The purpose of mission work is to establish the church throughout the world; when this has been done, the task of mission is complete.

Since the task is to build the church, numerous conversions are not enough; instead there must be a focus upon vigorous indigenous ministry. Patterns for surfacing and equipping local leadership should be simple, practical and suited to the local situation, not simply mimicking the institutional structures of the missionary-sending church. Churches must be treated as equals and direct cross-fertilization of younger churches (without the intermediary influences of London or New York) needs to flourish. There are roles for the missionary in the future but they will be different from the dominating, westernized roles of the past.

Reading this book 45 years after its creation, I find it is still applicable to the late twentieth-century church. I especially found Paton's theology of mission to be fresh and insightful. He also gives a much needed exhortation for us to be willing to see the problems in modern mission in relation to God's sovereign purposes: We must always assume God is on our side. While these insights challenge us even now, most of the practical observations and suggestions that Paton makes would be quite familiar to anyone who has read current missiological literature. Modern mission thinking has basically adopted the values Paton advocated, such as the need to break from Western dominance in mission. But that doesn't mean we live it out nearly well enough. I repeatedly felt the sting of Paton's prophetic message as I reflected on the churches here in Japan. Many of the sins of the fathers have been adopted and institutionalized within the indigenous church today. A half a century later, *Christian Missions and the Judgment of God* still calls missionaries and indigenous church leaders not only to change what they say, but what they do.

---

**Hibakusha Cinema: Hiroshima, Nagasaki and the Nuclear Image in Japanese Film**

Edited by Mick Broderick

London: Kegan Paul, International, 1996,  
252 pp.

---

*Reviewed by Patrice Van Hyle,  
Tokyo*

Mick Broderick, currently completing a Ph.D in apocalyptic narrative, works for the Australian Film Commission in Sydney. In this anthology, Broderick has compiled and edited a collection of eleven critical essays on the subgenre of *Hibakusha* Cinema (Japanese movies made in response to the atomic

bombings of Hiroshima and Nagasaki during World War II). The book's contributors are Japanese and foreign scholars, among them Susan Sontag and Donald Richie. Although there are many interesting insights on Japanese culture and psyche to be gleaned from this anthology, notably with regard to the aftereffects of the atom bomb on Japanese society, I found it a bit redundant to read similar discussions of the same films throughout the book with analyses often repeating each other word for word! Moreover, the 17-page introduction written by Broderick is much too long as it laboriously highlights each chapter's main points and structure almost to the point of rendering the rest of the book superfluous.

The motivation behind the book "to commemorate the 50th anniversary of the atom bombings and to give full recognition to often ignored popular culture responses to this catastrophic event" (2) is laudable. In my opinion, however, the highly technical and detailed nature of this book merit its use in a university film course as opposed to general reading. In this review, I will touch upon the most significant assertions and commentaries found within the various essays instead of a sequential synopsis.

One concept brought out by several contributors is the state of mind called *mono no aware* in Japanese, which recognizes the "sad beauty of life and transience of all earthly things." Many essayists agreed that this cultural attitude "close to a near-Buddhistic insistence upon a recognition of the eternal flux of life upon this earth" is directly related to the "Japanese view toward disaster and death" (Richie, 22) and was injected perhaps consciously or unconsciously into many of the films of Hibakusha cinema.

Discussions of Godzilla films made in Japan during the post World War II era also occupies a significant portion of the book. The film, Japan's first international hit, inspired 16 sequels and roughly a dozen

other "radioactive dinosaurs" (Noriega, 54). Godzilla can be interpreted as "a symbol of Japan, a monster aroused by U.S. hydrogen-bomb tests caught between the imperial past and the postwar industrial future" (Noriega, 61, 62). These movies "reveal a self-conscious attempt to deal with nuclear history and its effects on Japanese society" (Noriega, 54). It was fascinating to read how the story lines of Godzilla and other science fiction movies could be correlated to historical events of the Cold War era, namely the development of more lethal nuclear weaponry, including the U.S. testing of larger atomic bombs at Bikini atoll in the Pacific Ocean in 1946 and in 1948 and the U.S.S.R.'s development and testing of its own hydrogen atom bomb in 1953 (Goodwin, 180). Through its films, Japan found an outlet for "repressed anxieties about nuclear disaster" (Noriega, 71). As one essayist wrote, "in Japanese films, one gets the feeling that a mass trauma exists over the use of nuclear weapons. Science fiction films attempt to exorcise this trauma" (Sontag, 46).

One of the most educational aspects of this book was its in-depth description of the Allied Occupation of Japan from 1945–1952, and the U.S. authorities' strict censorship of all forms of Japanese artistic expression. Although Japanese filmmakers felt it urgent to create a permanent record of the destruction wreaked by the atomic bombs and, amazingly, succeeded in making documentaries of the affected cities and people, their work was confiscated and could not be released until after the occupation had ended. Even then, the Japanese government was very reluctant to have the films seen and in some cases prevented them from being shown in full (Hirano, 116).

Within one year of the conclusion of World War II, film director Akira Kurosawa began writing and directing *gendai mono* (films that "addressed social issues arising out of Japan's defeat, reconstruction and occupation by the Allies") (Goodwin, 178).

In 1955, no longer bound by the rules of censorship, he was free to deal directly with the atom bomb as a subject and wrote and directed "Record of a Living Being" (*Ikimono no kiroku*), considered by many film scholars to be "the best Japanese film on the A-bomb" (Richie, 33). Kurosawa's portrayal of the psychological schism created within a Japanese family, due to their opposing views toward the possibility of nuclear destruction, clearly illustrated "the social and psychological havoc produced by the atomic era."

It wasn't until almost 40 years later that Kurosawa made several more films on the atom bombings, namely "Rhapsody in August" (*Hachigatsu no kyōshikyoku*, 1991) which explored the rapid breakdown of the *ie* (stem family) system following World War II, the increasing number of issues associated with a growing but rejected elderly population in Japan and the psychological effect on children of intense pressure to achieve. "Dreams" (*Yume*, 1990) dealt with nuclear fall-out and destruction (Ehrlich, 166).

Another Hibakusha movie frequently highlighted in this anthology is Imamura Shohei's "Black Rain" (*Kuroi ame*, 1989). Set against the backdrop of the horrors of the aftermath of the bombing of Hiroshima, this film "looks at the victimization of explosion-affected people (hibakusha) by a society that reacts to them with suspicion and fear" (Goodwin, 193). In fact, the Japanese national government for over a decade after the bombings made no special provision for the economic relief of radiation victims. Not until 1957 did the A-Bomb Victims Medical Care Law go into effect, an indication of the "widespread social stigma and marginalization suffered by hibakusha" (Goodwin, 192).

Atom bomb films made by non-Japanese film directors are also included in this book "Hiroshima Mon Amour," by French filmmaker Alain Resnais, and "Typhoon in Nagasaki" (*Wasureenu bōjō*) by Yves Ciampi.

One essay, entitled "'Death and the Maiden': Female Hibakusha as Cultural Heroines,

and the Politics of A-bomb Memory," took an approach different from the others in its examination of the Hibakusha cinema's image of young female A-bomb survivors. The author, Maya Morioka Todeschini, concludes, "real life Hibakusha women do not want to be pitied or idealized. Japanese films' portrayal of them as long-suffering, virtuous survivors only serves to undermine their complaints of mental alienation and gender-based discrimination in marriage and the workplace as well as their demands for compensation from the Japanese government" (Todeschini, 244, 245).

The field of Japanese animation and children's entertainment was another particularly enlightening topic of discussion in this anthology. Playing out the themes of Armageddon, death, destruction and rebirth through sacrifice, essayists explored the significance of Japan's defeat and near-destruction in World War II and demonstrated its impact on animated TV, video, movies and "the apocalyptic imagination" (Freiberg, 95). Japan is the world's biggest producer and consumer of animation and comics (*manga*) as well as the major creative source behind the themes of robot-enhanced warfare that have dominated the field of animated TV and videos since the beginning of the 1970s evolving from the "simple good robot versus bad robot to epic struggles between civilisations peopled by psychologically complex characters" (Crawford, 82).

It was written 30 years ago that the Japanese had not "come to terms with the bomb" (Richie, 37). Through the various essays in Broderick's *Hibakusha Cinema*, the reader comprehends to a greater extent not only the physical damage wrought by the dropping of the atom bombs on Hiroshima and Nagasaki but also the severe emotional and psychological trauma caused by these tragic events which have yet to be fully integrated into Japanese society. Films, comics and videos, however, have allowed Japan

to make an artistic attempt to deal with these long-term and deeply embedded scars and have made a major contribution toward healing the wounds.

---

**Christianity Made in Japan: A Study of Indigenous Movements**

Mark Mullins

Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press,  
1998. 278 pp.

---

*Reviewed by Robert Kisala  
Nanzan Institute for Religion and Culture*

In *Christianity Made in Japan*, Mark Mullins presents the result of over ten years of field work on twelve Japanese indigenous Christian movements. These movements reveal another side to Christianity in Japan, a side often rejected by the missionary Christian churches and largely ignored by scholars of religion. The wealth of insights gained by Mullins' study indicates that the attention he has given to these groups is long overdue.

Mullins approaches his topic as both a committed member of a church that has transplanted itself in Japan (viii) and a sociologist of religion. As part of the missionary church in Japan he reflects on what these movements can reveal about Christianity's failure to take root in Japan, focusing particularly on the issue of inculturation. As a sociologist Mullins offers a consideration of such themes as global cultures, religious vitality and charismatic figures.

The first three chapters place the Japanese indigenous Christian movements within their respective historical and theoretical backgrounds. Chapter One provides a brief summary of some of the issues involved in the transplantation of religion to a foreign culture, leading to a discussion of indigenization as the process by which a foreign religion is

no longer perceived as an alien or deviant phenomenon (6). Mullins contends that, while small or even insignificant in the number of believers they have attracted overall, the indigenous movements provide us with perhaps the only opportunity to see what an indigenized Christianity might look like in this country, since the missionary churches are still perceived as Western imports. The subsequent chapter deals with the development of the more Western-style Christianity in Japan, while Chapter Three provides a sociological consideration of the emergence of indigenous movements. Taken together they present the historical and theoretical framework of this study.

Previous research on the indigenization of Christianity in Japan has focused on Uchimura Kanzō and his Nonchurch Movement. Mullins likewise begins with this movement, pointing out that it has functioned as the fountainhead of indigenous Christianity in Japan and given rise to many other movements (54). However a major contribution of this present study, with the perspective offered by the wide variety of groups under consideration, is the observation that Uchimura's group was like the missionary Christian churches that he rejected in attracting followers mainly among intellectuals and thus does not present a complete picture of Japanese Christian indigenization. The more interesting story is what happens to Christianity when it is taken up by the "riff-raff," to borrow a term used by Mullins in his final chapter (201).

Chapters Five and Six present this story, the first dealing with two groups that incorporate popular Confucian ideas of self-cultivation (The Way and The Christ Heart Church). The latter chapter focuses on three Pentecostal (or, to use Mullins' term, Apostolic) movements: The Spirit of Jesus Church, The Holy Ecclesia of Jesus and The Original Gospel Movement. In this way the present study serves to highlight the fact that these indigenous movements both reflect some of

the common characteristics of new religious movements in Japan (the emphasis on self-cultivation and personal religious experience) as well as provide local examples of the current worldwide growth in pentecostal movements.

Ancestor veneration has been seen as a major problem for Christian inculturation not only in Japan but throughout Asia and Africa. A chapter is devoted specifically to this problem, exploring how it has been dealt with both by the missionary churches and the indigenous movements in Japan. The belief that the spirits of the dead remain active, causing either good or bad effects on the world of the living, is one of the enduring characteristics of Japanese religiosity, illustrated especially by the activities of some of the new religious movements. Mullins' research indicates that some of these indigenous movements, through vicarious baptism or other rites, offer a means to pacify the ancestor spirits and transform them into benevolent guardians, thus contributing in a small way to the re-enchantment of the world through their recognition of the interdependence of the visible and invisible realms (121).

If these groups are so successful in incorporating elements of both Japanese religiosity and contemporary spiritual movements worldwide, we are left with the question of their failure to attract a large following. In Chapter Eight Mullins examines the comparative growth of the indigenous movements and the missionary churches. He finds that many of these movements are in even greater decline than the mainline churches in Japan. Clearly inculturation is not a sufficient strategy for church growth in

this context, and Mullins attempts an exploration of other factors involved, focusing finally on a contrast with the growth of Christianity in Korea. In the end, however, little new light is shed on the issue, beyond the conclusion that inculturation will not act as a panacea for church growth in all situations. Nevertheless, as this book argues, the Japanese Way of Christianity presented by these groups is important in and of itself, both for the missionary churches and for researchers of religion in Japan.

While covering a wide range of material and topics, the book is relatively brief and accessible even to non-specialists. Only six of the indigenous movements are treated at length in the text; brief resumes of the other groups are provided in an appendix. The appendix also provides a bibliographical guide to all twelve of the movements, an important resource for future research on these groups.

*Christianity Made in Japan* is a pioneering work, offering fresh insights for missiologists, religious researchers and Christians with an interest in Japan. These insights are in need of further refinement and development, of course, and we can only hope that other researchers will take up Mullins' invitation to pick up where he has left off. The book is published by the Nanzan Institute for Religion and Culture and the University of Hawai'i Press as part of the Nanzan Library of Asian Religion and Culture. As a member of the Nanzan Institute, I must admit that I might be biased towards the merits of this work. I have little fear, however, that my judgment on the importance of this book will prove to be unfounded.